

Shabbos Yom Kippur:

Discovering the *Oneg* in the *Inuy* of Life

Yom Kippur is a day entirely devoted to the spiritual experience of being *lifnei Hashem*, before G-d. The Torah tells us:

כִּי בַיּוֹם הַזֶּה יִכַּפֵּר עֲלֵיכֶם לְטַהֵר אֶתְכֶם מִכָּל חַטֹּאתֵיכֶם לִפְנֵי ה' תִּטְהָרוּ.

For on this day atonement shall be made for you to cleanse you of all your sins; you shall be clean before the Lord.

Vayikra 16:30

We reach the climax of connection with the Divine through a variety of ways: the context created within the solemnity of the day; our complete immersion in the world of prayer; and the abdication of our basic physical pleasures and needs in order to accentuate the vibrancy of our soul. Interestingly, the dominant halachic character of Yom Kippur is in the observance of its restrictions: the prohibitions against eating, drinking, bathing, anointing, wearing leather footwear, and marital intimacy.

Indeed, the poskim are clear that if illness compromises one's capacity to fully observe the fast, it is more important to remain home and spend the day resting in bed, than to attend shul and risk having to expend enough energy that would require eating or drinking (*Shemiras Shabbos KeHilchasa* 39:28). The obligation to fast on Yom Kippur is one of the Torah's most stringent expectations. Violating this prohibition is subject to the punishment of *kareis* (Vayikra 23:29). Yet the Gemara in Yoma



Rabbi Yaakov Glasser

David Mitzner Dean, YU Center for the Jewish Future
Rabbi, Young Israel of Passaic-Clifton, NJ

85a, states unequivocally that any Torah prohibition, aside from the three cardinal sins, whose observance would risk a person's life, is suspended indefinitely in deference to the health and wellbeing of the individual. There are occasional situations, therefore, in which eating and drinking on Yom Kippur becomes necessary, and as such, a requirement. It is beyond the scope of this article to address the parameters of health conditions and their relevant halachic requirements with respect to Yom Kippur. Some situations permit an individual to attempt to fast, some permit the eating and drinking of *shiurim*, which would entail a lower form of prohibition, and some situations demand a total capitulation to satiating the body with food.

The question we are going to explore, from both a halachic and a hashkafic perspective, is: how does an individual who is required to eat on Yom Kippur relate to the halachic character of the day? How does this individual observe and relate to Yom Kippur?

Birkas HaMazon

The *Tur*, *Orach Chaim* no. 618, writes in the name of his father, the Rosh:

חולה שאכל בי"ה ונתיישב דעתו בענין שיכול לברך היה אומר אדוני אבי הרא"ש ז"ל שצריך להזכיר של י"ה בברכת המזון שאומר יעלה ויבא בבונה ירושלים.

If an individual ate on Yom Kippur (for health reasons) and is of a mindset that would allow him to recite a blessing, my father, Rabbeinu Asher, has said that he should mention Yom Kippur in Grace After Meals by reciting Ya'aleh V'Yavo in the blessing about building Jerusalem.

An individual who eats on Yom Kippur is required to recite Birkas HaMazon and include *Yaaleh VeYavo* with the individualized insertion of "*Yom HaKippurim hazeh*." The *Beis Yosef* quotes the Maharam MiRutenburg who presents the following formulation:

ודבר פשוט הוא דבהיתר אכיל ואדרבה מצוה קא עביד הוי לדידיה יום הכפורים כמו לדידן שאר ימים טובים.

This is an obvious point because the individual was permitted to eat the food. In fact it was a mitzvah, and for this individual, Yom Kippur is like our other festivals.

Beis Yosef, Orach Chaim no. 618

Yom Kippur is comprised of many dimensions of sanctity. It has the underlying *kedusha* of a standard yom tov, which is suppressed

and overshadowed by the unique requirements of *inuy* (affliction). Therefore, the festive aspect of Yom Kippur's identity usually remains dormant. However, if a person must break his or her fast, this dimension emerges and presents the identical manifesting elements of a yom tov, like any other chag, namely, the inclusion of *Yaaleh VeYavo*.

The *Shulchan Aruch, Orach Chaim* 618:10, rules that one who eats on Yom Kippur recites *Yaaleh VeYavo*. The *Knesses HaGedolah, Orach Chaim* 618, goes so far as to require *lechem mishneh* (two loaves of bread), however the *Magen Avraham* states that this is not the accepted practice. In fact, the *Magen Avraham* quotes the *Shibolei HaLeket*, who presents an entirely different perspective. The *Shibolei HaLeket* quotes Rav Avigdor Katz that the permissibility to eat on Yom Kippur essentially unravels the entire character of Yom Kippur altogether. He describes the day for this individual as “*hava ledidei kechol*” — for this individual, the day is like an ordinary weekday — and therefore one does not make Kiddush or mention Yom Kippur in Birkas HaMazon. The *Magen Avraham* himself seems to agree fundamentally with this opinion, but in deference to the *Tur*, he suggests reciting *Yaaleh VeYavo*, while exempting one from making Kiddush because of a concern of *beracha levatalah* (blessing in vain). The *Taz, Orach Chaim* 618:10, seems to agree with the *Magen Avraham* in principle, but goes further and exempts one from including *Yaaleh VeYavo* in Birkas HaMazon without any concern for the opinion of the *Tur*. The *Mishna Berurah* 618:29 follows the ruling of the *Magen Avraham* that one recites *Yaaleh VeYavo* but not Kiddush and adds that if one forgot the insertion, one would not repeat Birkas HaMazon.

This dispute is explained by R. Mayer Rooz, *Minchas Mayer* no. 15, as being rooted in the nature of the underlying sanctity of Yom Kippur. According to one approach, there are two conflicting identities to Yom Kippur. On the one hand, it has the status of yom tov. On the other hand, it is a day of *inuy*. The Torah is clear that the requirements of *inuy* dominate the elements of yom tov. However, when those requirements are lifted, then perhaps the generic *kedushas yom tov* would reemerge, requiring one to at least recite *Yaaleh VeYavo*, and possibly engage in other elements of the yom tov experience.

The other approach views the *inuy* on Yom Kippur as definitional to the entire nature of the day. It is not a yom tov that is overshadowed by *inuy*, but rather it is fundamentally a day of *inuy*. It is a *mikra kodesh* — a festival, but its nature is a *mikra kodesh* of *inuy*. As a result, if one becomes exempt from the *inuyim*, the entire nature of the day has been compromised and we would not encounter any of the generic yom tov qualities in the resulting reality. The *mikra kodesh* is no longer applicable. An *issur melacha* (prohibition against creative labor) remains, but the underlying character of the yom tov is gone.

When Yom Kippur Occurs on Shabbos

Rav Akiva Eiger, in his glosses to the aforementioned *Magen Avraham*, makes a fascinating distinction between a calendar year in which Yom Kippur occurs on a weekday, and one in which it occurs on Shabbos. If Yom Kippur occurs on Shabbos, there is another layer of *kedusha* that has been added to this reality. Even if the *Magen Avraham* and the *Taz* are

correct that there is no *mikra kodesh* independent of *inuy* that would require reciting Kiddush on Yom Kippur, this is only because Kiddush on yom tov is a rabbinic enactment and the rabbis never instituted Kiddush on Yom Kippur. However, on Shabbos, when there is a biblical obligation to recite Kiddush, one would imagine that there is a requirement to recite Kiddush. Furthermore, Shabbos exists as an entity independent from Yom Kippur, and therefore, when the obligations of Yom Kippur do not prevent one from fulfilling the obligations of Shabbos, one should fulfill those obligations.

Yet we find a different approach to the convergence of Shabbos and Yom Kippur in a comment of R. Meir Simcha of Dvinsk. The Rambam writes:

עבודת כל חמש עשרה בהמות אלו הקריבין ביום זה אינה אלא בכהן גדול בלבד ... ואם היתה שבת אף מוסף שבת אין מקריב אותו אלא כהן גדול.

The offering of these fifteen animals on [Yom Kippur] must be performed by the Kohen Gadol ... If [Yom Kippur] occurs on Shabbos, the mussaf offering of Shabbos must be performed by the Kohen Gadol.

Rambam, Hilchos Avodas Yom HaKippurim 1:2

Why does the offering for Shabbos have to be brought specifically by the Kohen Gadol? On an ordinary Shabbos, any Kohen can bring the Shabbos offering. R. Meir Simcha, *Ohr Sameiach, Hilchos Avodas Yom HaKippurim* 4:1, explains that the Rambam is of the opinion that when Yom Kippur occurs on Shabbos, the entire nature of *kedushas Shabbos* becomes redefined by the experience of Yom Kippur. For this reason, the offerings that are exclusive and unique to Shabbos also become part

of the service of the Kohen Gadol. The *Minchas Mayer* argues that the comments of the *Ohr Sameiach* present a challenge to R Akiva Eiger. One sees from the Rambam that the *kedusha* of Shabbos does not exist as an independent entity when Yom Kippur occurs on Shabbos.

The convergence of Shabbos and Yom Kippur can be understood in two ways. One is to view the experience of *inuy* as entirely independent of Shabbos, while the other recognizes the capacity of *inuy* to redefine the nature of the Shabbos experience entirely.

In life, we strive mightily to discover meaning and resonance in the world of *mikra kodesh*. There are many aspects of our religious experience that present moments of sanctity, and our challenge is to connect to their purpose and to their transformative impact upon our lives. Indeed, there is a hovering angelic dimension to Yom Kippur that is palpable in an experiential and very tangible way. Part of our mandate on Yom Kippur, through the requirements of *inuy*, is to strip away our indulgence and temptation, and focus ourselves entirely on the purest form of sanctified existence. In a world where the notion of spirituality and transcendence is entirely counter cultural, this is becoming increasingly challenging. We ourselves, and certainly our children, are finding the synagogue experience more and more distant from our modern lives and contemporary experiences. Shuls throughout the world recognize the difficulty of connecting to the world of Yom Kippur and are introducing

programs and opportunities for people to address those concerns. Yet this is one of the dimensions of Yom Kippur that is so crucial, and expressed so poignantly by the position that we continue to recite *Yaaleh VeYavo*, make Kiddush, and perhaps even include *lechem mishneh* in a compromised Yom Kippur experience. The *inuyim* of Yom Kippur are not an obstacle to *avodas Hashem*. On Yom Kippur, they act as a vehicle to create the context for *avodas Hashem* without any distractions.

However, viewing the experience from the perspective of the *Ohr Sameiach*, perhaps there is an additional message as well. We so often bifurcate our lives between the religious ideals we seek to observe and to embrace, and the extraordinary challenges that we face in moving forward in our own personal development and *avodas Hashem*. We view the *inuyim* of life as a barrier to religious growth — one that stands in opposition to the momentum that we seek to create with our commitment, Torah learning, and religious observance. Yom Kippur is perhaps projecting a different message. Those challenges are not independent of our religious experience, but are, rather, part of it. As the Ramban explains regarding the *nissayon* (test) of Avraham:

ענין הנסיון הוא לדעתו בעבור היות מעשה האדם רשות מוחלטת בידו אם ירצה יעשה ואם לא ירצה לא יעשה יקרא "נסיון" מצד המנוסה אבל המנסה יתברך יצוה בו להוציא הדבר מן הכח אל הפועל להיות לו שכל מעשה טוב לא שכלר לב טוב בלבד ... והנה כל הנסיונות שבתורה לטובת המנוסה

The issue of this test, in my opinion, shows that a person has the absolute authority to perform an action; one can do what they want, and not do what one doesn't want. It is called a "nissayon" [test] for the individual being tested [e.g., Avraham], but the blessed Tester will command him to bring out the thing from ability to actuality, giving a reward for a good action and not just a reward for a good heart. ... And behold, every test in the Torah is for the good of the one being tested.

Ramban, Bereishis 22:1

The purpose of a *nissayon* is to bring out the latent potential that exists within a person. Perhaps the purpose of Yom Kippur is indeed to make life a little harder so that we can discover how those very challenges are also a platform to cultivate a close relationship with the Divine — to learn how the challenges of our lives are truly opportunities to shape a meaningful and purposeful existence. If this can be accomplished, then Shabbos becomes part of Yom Kippur as well, and in suspension of the *inuyim*, we would not encounter a remaining echo of *kedushas Shabbos*, since the two dimensions are in fact inseparable.

People sometimes turn to religion in the hope that it is a utopian escape from life. A cocooned space of inspiration and meaning that we can retreat to from the vicissitudes of our lives. In reality what Yom Kippur is teaching us is that the *oneg* (enjoyment) and *simcha* of Shabbos can be experienced through the pain and challenge of *inuy* as well. In this way, it is a day when we can utilize life's challenges as a foundation for growth.



Find more shiurim and articles from Rabbi Yaakov Glasser at <http://www.yutorah.org/Rabbi-Yaakov-Glasser>