The Torah u-Madda Journal
An annual devoted to the interaction between
Torah and general culture.

Copyright © 2001 Rabbi Isaac Elchanan Theological Seminary,
an affiliate of Yeshiva University.

David Shatz, Editor
Joel B. Wolowelsky, Associate Editor
Anne Gordon, Editorial Assistant
Jacob J. Schacter, Founding Editor

A publication of
The Torah u-Madda Project
Yeshiva University
500 West 185th Street
New York, NY 10033

The Torah u-Madda Project gratefully acknowledges the support of the
Joseph J. and Bertha K. Green Memorial Fund at the Rabbi Isaac Elchanan
Theological Seminary, established by Morris L. (Moshe) Green ק''צ.

The Torah u-Madda Journal is soliciting appropriate articles
for publication. Please send your manuscript to:

Dr. David Shatz
Editor, The Torah u-Madda Journal
Stern College for Women
Yeshiva University
245 Lexington Avenue
New York, NY 10016

Back issues of volumes 6, 7, 8 and 9 are available. For further
information, contact The Max Stern Division of Communal Services,
Yeshiva University, 500 West 185th Street, New York, NY 10033.
(Fax: 212.960.5228.) Volumes 1–5 are out of print.

PRINTED IN THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
CONTENTS

FOREWORD—IN TRIBUTE

David Shatz

vi

IN GRATITUDE

Jacob J. Schacter and David Shatz

viii

ARTICLES

Body and Soul: Teḥiyyat ha-Metim and Gilgulim in Medieval and Modern Philosophy

Yitzchak Blau

1

The Torah Commentary of R. Nissim ben Moshe of Marseilles: On a Medieval Approach to Torah u-Madda

Haim Kreisel

20

On the Limits of Non-Literal Interpretation of Scripture from an Orthodox Perspective

Joshua L. Golding

37

Flowing Upstream: Reflections on Studying Gandhi at Yeshiva

Shalom Carmy

60

Six Days Shall You Toil: Classic Jewish Work Values in Summary and Comparative Religious Perspective

David J. Schnall

69

Employee Agreements Not to Compete in American Law, Economic Theory and Halakhah

Aaron Levine

95

The Ḥillazon and the Principle of “Muttar be-Fikha”

Mois Navon

142
The Torah u-Madda Journal

REVIEW ESSAYS

Gerald J. Blidstein 163

The War Among the Jews (Samuel G. Freedman, Jew vs. Jew: The Struggle for the Soul of American Jewry)
Bernard J. Firestone 173

OUR READERS RESPOND 182

American Orthodoxy, 1900-1960
Yosef Blau
Matthew M. Zuckerman
Jeffrey S. Gurock

The Implications of a Jewish Virtue Ethic
Yitzchok Oratz

Clones and Golems
Simcha Feuerman

A Mathematical Proof of Kinnim 3:2
William L. Gewirtz
Philip Reiss

On a Little Known Edition of Tractate Niddah
Lawrence J. Kaplan
Marvin J. Heller

The Letters of Rav Weinberg
Avraham Abba Weingort

INDEX TO VOLUMES 1-10
Atara Graubard Segal 200

GUIDE TO TRANSLITERATION STYLE 214

FORMAT OF REFERENCES 216
We mourn the loss of

**Rav Ahron Soloveichik** וּזְנוּל

a gadol ba-Torah who taught us ethics, integrity and heroism

and of

**Rebbetzin Ella Soloveichik** וּשְׁעַה

a distinguished educator, the personification of hesed, and an indomitable support for her husband and family

ת"ה תר"ס ב"ה
This volume of The Torah u-Madda Journal is an especially poignant one, for it is the last that will be published during Dr. Norman Lamm’s historic tenure as president of Yeshiva University.

Rabbi Lamm is known worldwide as a creative thinker and in particular as the eloquent voice of the Torah u-Madda philosophy. It bears emphasizing, however, that his impact on the growth of Torah u-Madda does not lie only in his articulating and arguing for the approach (most fully in his book Torah U-Madda), nor even in his conceiving and supporting many projects which, like this journal, are dedicated to its realization. Rather, in addition to advocating, inspiring, and enhancing the work of integration, Dr. Lamm fortified the Torah and the madda of Yeshiva University as separate entities, thereby heightening the possibilities for meaningful interaction.

His administration saw an increased focus on our institution as a mekom Torah. He enabled the Rabbi Isaac Elchanan Theological Seminary to attract, in ever growing numbers, outstanding Talmud students who have brought us pride and have benefited communities all over the globe. The appointment during his presidency of stellar new rashei yeshivah, the assignment of endowed chairs, and the creation of several kollelim are enduring parts of his legacy to RIETS. In addition, he presided during the exciting growth of the Rebecca Ivry Department of Jewish Studies at Stern College for Women and the founding of the Graduate Program in Advanced Talmudic Study for Women. Simultaneously, Yeshiva’s undergraduate schools dramatically expanded the scope of their general studies courses and heightened their quality, bringing them into the top tier of American colleges.

As Rabbi Lamm has written: “Torah u-Madda does not mean that the two domains will be interdigitated, that Žumash will be taught predominantly from the point of view of the history of the ancient Near East, or biology expounded based mainly upon the commentaries to Sefer Bereshit. Each, Torah and madda, has its own immanent telos, its
own methodology, and it is impermissible to mix and match them at will, lest the unique power of each be compromised. The encounter of Torah and madda presumes that first the integrity of each is confirmed, and that only then can we expect the encounter to be fruitful. In the words of Rabbi Abraham Isaac Kook, ‘One begins with separation and concludes with unification’.

Unification of Torah u-Madda in our time can proceed only when Torah and madda are strong and richly nurtured individually. Rabbi Lamm guided both processes, cultivation and unification, to dramatic outcomes. We wish him many years of continued productivity as he will remain for us, ad me’ah ve-esrim, an inspiring, revered and influential leader.

DAVID SHATZ
On the occasion of this milestone tenth volume, we extend appreciation to Rabbi Robert S. Hirt, Assistant to the President, who oversees the Torah u-Madda Project. We are grateful for his insightful counsel and encouragement.

We also thank Mrs. Marcia Schwartz, administrator of the Max Stern Division of Communal Services, without whom the issues could not appear. We value her reliability and good sense as integral parts of the publication process.

JACOB J. SCHACTER  
*Founding Editor*

DAVID SHATZ  
*Editor*
INSTRUCTIONS FOR CONTRIBUTORS

The Torah u-Madda Journal publishes manuscripts that either (1) address the question of Judaism’s relationship to general culture, whether in the broad sense or in the context of a specific discipline or field; or (2) exemplify the integration of Jewish and general knowledge in the treatment of a specific topic. The journal appears annually.

Manuscripts should be submitted in triplicate hard copy, typed on 8½” x 11” paper with ample margins on all sides. All material should be double spaced, including notes and block quotations. Notes should appear at the end of the manuscript, beginning on a new page, rather than as footnotes on the bottoms of the pages. Use the automatic note numbering feature of your word processing program when you compose the endnotes, so that notes can easily be renumbered if necessary. After a manuscript is accepted, the author will be expected to supply an electronic file.

The author’s name should not be disclosed on the manuscript, as the journal’s policy is to withhold this information from referees. The following information should be included on a separate cover sheet: author’s name, professional affiliation, mailing address, telephone and fax numbers, and e-mail address.

A guide to our transliteration style and reference format appears in the back of this issue.

Manuscripts and letters intended for publication should be sent to: Dr. David Shatz, Editor, The Torah u-Madda Journal, Stern College for Women, Yeshiva University, 245 Lexington Avenue, New York, NY 10016. Correspondence other than submissions may be sent to the editor at shatz@ymail.yu.edu.